



Department of Health

ANDREW M. CUOMO
Governor

HOWARD A. ZUCKER, M.D., J.D.
Commissioner

SALLY DRESLIN, M.S., R.N.
Executive Deputy Commissioner

July 8, 2016

Cat Mosley, Public Affairs Manager
Apex Clean Energy
310 4111 Street NE, Suite 200
Charlottesville, VA 22902

**Re: Case No. 15-F-0327: Preliminary Scoping Statement for the
Galloo Island Wind Energy Facility**

Dear Ms. Mosley:

New York State Department of Health staff reviewed the Preliminary Scoping Statement (PSS) for the Galloo Island Wind Energy Facility, located in the Town of Hounsfield (Jefferson County). The PSS was prepared for Apex Clean Energy by Environmental Design and Research and is dated June 2016.

We believe that the attached comments developed by Department of Health Staff, pertaining primarily to potential public health concerns associated with the proposal, will assist in developing an application that will fully address the needs of the local communities and the public more generally.

Thank you for your consideration of these comments. Should you have any questions please do not hesitate to contact me by email at Richard.Thomas1@health.ny.gov or by phone at (518) 473-1403.

Sincerely,

Richard Thomas
Assistant Counsel
Bureau of House Counsel

Cc: Honorable Kathleen H. Burgess
Service List

New York State Department of Health
Staff Comments on Preliminary Scoping Statement

- 1) The Preliminary Scoping Statement (PSS) indicates that public health impacts will be negligible due to the remote location of the project. While Galloo Island is currently uninhabited, the existing home (currently listed on-line for sale) and a proposed dormitory intended to house construction workers may provide future residence(s) on the island. Unless there will be assurances, provisions, deed restrictions or other mechanisms to prevent future occupancy (seasonal or permanent) of these structures, potential public health impacts at these locations should be considered. Also, if the lighthouse is publicly accessible, the application should consider whether there will be any potential, albeit short duration, impacts to boating visitors who may use the natural harbors present on the island.
- 2) The PSS indicates that the high-voltage transmission cable will undergo a separate Article 7 proceeding. However, because the connection to the high-voltage transmission cable is necessary for this facility, health and safety impacts to potentially affected residents and recreational users of Lake Ontario associated with construction and operation of the transmission cable should be considered as part of the Article 10 application.
- 3) The PSS indicates that the application will explore potential impacts related to construction of the facility. The Article 10 application should include any potential public health impacts associated with increased accidents and noise associated with traffic, as well as emissions to air during construction activities (*e.g.*, emissions from the batch plant, truck traffic, and barge activities at docks). The application should also include discussion of alternatives or approaches to mitigate impacts.
- 4) The PSS indicates that a pre-construction (winter-time) and post-construction (season unspecified) sound surveys will be conducted for a Noise Impact Assessment, using three sound monitoring locations (one on Galloo Island, two on the mainland in the Towns of Lyme and Henderson). The applicant should provide a rationale for the selection and appropriateness of these three sites and also consider a monitoring location at the seasonal residential site on Stony Island which is closer to the project than the mainland. In addition to the World Health Organization's (WHO) "Guidelines for Community Noise" (1999), guidelines listed in WHO's 2009 "Night Noise Guidelines for Europe," which is an extension to – and update of – WHO's 1999 guidance, should be used to evaluate the project's potential noise impacts.¹

¹ See: http://www.euro.who.int/__data/assets/pdf_file/0017/43316/E92845.pdf

- 5) The PSS indicates that, due the remote nature of the project, public health impacts associated with “shadow flicker” will be negligible and that a shadow flicker analysis is unnecessary. This statement is based on an analysis that show flicker impacts are generally considered negligible at distances beyond roughly 10 rotor diameters, citing two studies that are not identified in the PSS reference list (see top of page 61). The rotor diameters of the turbines should be identified in the PSS to increase transparency. Either the applicant should provide sufficient information in the PSS to support the conclusion that a shadow flicker analysis is not necessary, or it should conduct an analysis of shadow flicker which includes worst-case seasonal and time of day solar zenith angles.
- 6) The PSS identifies two potential environmental justice (EJ) communities in the Towns of Cape Vincent and Clayton. However, the New York State Department of Environmental Conservation’s potential EJ map² also identifies a portion of the City of Watertown, which is a similar distance to the project as the communities identified in the PSS. Additionally, the application should include a map of the nearest potential EJ areas.
- 7) The PSS indicates that there is one potable water well on Galloo Island. The applicants should assess the quantity and quality of this well prior to blasting and drilling activities and verify that it is suitable for use as a source of drinking water.

² See: <http://www.dec.ny.gov/public/899.html>